BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06090882 9

CONFRONTING MISCARRIAGES OF JUSTICE IN CANADA

Professor Gary T. Trotter
and
Professor Kent Roach

Fall 2003

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students at Queen's University and the University of Toronto.

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
SEP - 3 2003
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CONFRONTING MISCARRIAGES OF JUSTICE IN CANADA

Professor Gary T. Trotter
and
Professor Kent Roach

Fall 2003

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students at Queen's University and the University of Toronto.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/confrontingmisca00trot

Confronting Miscarriages of Justice in Canada

Professor Gary T. Trotter
Professor Kent Roach

These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students at Queen's University and the University of Toronto

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview

Clive Walker, "Miscarriages of Justice in Principle and Practice", in Clive Walker and Keith Starmer, *Miscarriages of Justice: A Review of Justice in Error* (1999), pp.31-55 1

Huff, Rattner and Sagarin, *Convicted But Innocent: Wrongful Conviction and Public Policy* (1996), pp.10-20, 53-67 14

Huff "Wrongful convictions and public policy" (2002) 40 Criminology 1-18 27

R. v. Burns and Rafay (2001), 151 C.C.C. (3d) 97 at paras 1-3, 70, 71, 95-117 (S.C.C.) 34

Chapter 2: Suspect Evidence (1): Eyewitness Identification

Hon. Peter deC. Cory, *The Inquiry Regarding Thomas Sophonow - The Investigation, Prosecution and Consideration of Entitlement to Compensation* (Winnipeg: Manitoba Justice, 2001) (henceforth Sophonow Inquiry) 45

Jill Copeland, "Helping Jurors Recognize the Frailties of Eyewitness Identification Evidence" (2002), 46 C.L.Q. 187 66

J. Grano "A Legal Response to the Inherent Dangers of Eyewitness Identification Testimony" in Wells and Loftus, *Eyewitness Testimony* (1984) 77

R. v. McIntosh (1997), 117 C.C.C. (3d) 385 (Ont.C.A.) 90

Chapter 3: Suspect Evidence (2): Jailhouse Informants

Hon. F. Kaufman (Chair), *Report of the Commission on Proceedings Involving Guy Paul Morin* (Toronto: Ontario Ministry of the Attorney General, 1998) at 556-642 (henceforth Kaufman Report) 98

Chris Sherrin, "Jailhouse Informants in the Canadian Criminal Justice System, Part II: Option for Reform" (1998), 40 C.L.Q. 157-186 141

R. v. Brooks (2000), 141 C.C.C. (3d) 321 (S.C.C.) 157

Chapter 4: Suspect Evidence (3): False Confessions

Richard A. Leo, "False Confessions: Causes, Consequences, and Solutions" in Westervelt and Humphrey, *Wrongly Convicted: Perspectives on Failed Justice* (2001) 182

Paul G. Cassell, "Protecting the Innocent from False Confessions and Lost Confessions—and from Miranda" (1998), 99 J. Crim. L. & Criminology 497 191

R. v. Oickle (2001), 147 C.C.C. (3d) 321 (S.C.C.) 222

R. v. Ahmed (2003), 170 C.C.C. (3d) 27 (Ont. C.A.) 229

Chapter 5: Forensic Evidence and DNA

Kaufman Report, pp.249-291, 300-311 234

U.S. Dept of Justice, *Convicted by Juries, Exonerated by Science* (1996) at 12-32 289

Scheck and Neufeld, "DNA and Innocence Scholarship" in Westervelt 311

G. Edmond, "Construing Miscarriages of Justice" (2003), 22 Oxford J. of Legal Studies 53 318

R. v. J.(J-L.) (2000), 148 C.C.C. (3d) 487 (S.C.C.) (headnote) 355

Stephen Odgers and James Richardson, "Keeping Bad Science out of the Courtroom" (1995) 18 Univ. of New South Wales L.J. 108 358

Chapter 6: The Police and Wrongful Convictions: Malfeasance and Tunnel Vision

Dianne Martin, "The Police Role in Wrongful Convictions: An International Comparative Study" in Westervelt 369

Kaufman Report, pp.1117-1127, 1136-1138, 1191-1201 379

Sophnow Report 391

Illinois Commission on Capital Punishment, ch 2. 402

Epp, "Penetrating Police Investigative Practice Post *Morin*" (1997) 31 U.B.C.L.Rev. 95 433

Chapter 7: Counsel, Judge and Jury

a) Ineffective Assistance of Counsel

R. v. G.D.B. [2000] 1 S.C.R. 520 449

Stephen Bright Testimony 457

Marshall Inquiry, pp. 72-77 465

b) Overly Aggressive Prosecutors

Marshall Inquiry, pp. 71-72 464

R. v. S.(F.) (2000) 144 C.C.C.(3d) 466 (Ont.C.A.) 473

Marshall Inquiry, pp. 85-87 481

c) Judges

Marshall Inquiry, pp. 77-79 470

Marshall Inquiry, pp. 87-88, 116-127 483

W. Schwarzer, "Dealing with Incompetent Counsel: The Trial Judge's Role" (1980) 93 Harv. L. Rev. 633 497

d) Juries

Roach, excerpt from *Due Process and Victims' Rights* (1999) 527

R. v.Pan; R. v. Sawyer [2001] 2 S.C.R. 344 (headnote) 530

Chapter 8: Appellate Review and Ministerial Intervention

Kate Malleson, "Miscarriages of Justice and the Accessibility of the Court of Appeal" [1991] Crim.L.R. 323 534

R. Nobles, D. Schiff and N. Shaldon, "The Inevitability of Crisis in Criminal Appeals" (1993) 21 Int. J of Sociology of Law 1-23 539

Kaufman Report, pp. 1178-1193 550

Patricia Braiden and Joan Brockman, "Remedying Wrongful Convictions Through Applications to the Minister of Justice Under Section 690 of the Criminal Code" (1999) 17 W.Y.B.Access to Justice 3 558

Department of Justice, *Addressing Miscarriages of Justice: Reform Possibilities for Section 690 of the Criminal Code* (1998) 575

Criminal Code ss. 696.1-696.6 596

G. Trotter, "Justice, Politics and the Royal Prerogative of Mercy" (2001) 26 Queens L.J. 339 599

Chapter 9: Independent Commissions

L. Griffin "The Correction of Wrongful Convictions: A Comparative Perspective" (2001) 16 Am. U. Int. L.Rev. 1241 626

Runicman Report, pp. 180-187 661

Annabelle James et al, "The Criminal Cases Review Commission: Economy, Effectiveness and Justice" [2000] Crim.L.Rev. 140 669

L.H. Leigh, "Correcting Miscarriages of Justice: The Role of the Criminal Cases Review Commission" (2000) 38 Alta. L. Rev. 365 676

See www.ccrc.gov.uk for the Commission's helpful web site

Marshall Inquiry, pp.143-146 683

Chapter 10: Media and Advocacy Groups

Rob Warden, "The Revolutionary Role of Journalism in Identifying and Rectifying Wrongful Convictions" (2002) 70 UMKC L.Rev. 803 687

Mark Stephens and Peter Hill, "The Role and Impact of Journalism" in Walker and Starmer 709

See www.innocenceproject.org

See www.aidwyc.org

Chapter 11: Public Inquiries and Wrongful Convictions

K. Roach, "Inquiring into Wrongful Convictions" (1999) 35 Crim. L. Bulletin 152 721

B. Scheck and P. Neufeld, "Toward the Formation of 'Innocence Commissions' in America" (2002) 86 Judicature 98 730

R. Nobles and D. Schiff, "Optimism Writ Large: A Critique of the Runciman Commission on Criminal Justice" in McConville and Bridges, *Criminal Justice in Crisis* (1994) 743

P. Hillyard, "The Politics of Criminal Injustice: The Irish Dimension" in McConville and Bridges 747

Chapter 12: Compensation and Prevention

S. Roberts, "'Unsafe' Convictions: Defining and Compensating Miscarriages of Justice" (2003) 66 Mod. L.Rev. 441 753

Sophonow Inquiry 759

Hon. Justice Michael Kirby, "Miscarriages of Justice – Our Lamentable Failure" [1991] Denning L.J. 97 792